

CHINASCOPE Analysis Series

Communist China's Cultural Invasion of the World

April 2019

Summary: The Chinese Communist Party (CCP) has adopted and, for many years, has carried out its strategy of "Culture Going Global." The following is a report that Chinascope has created focusing on that strategy, on related government policies, and on the implementation of the CCP's efforts.

Summary

The most significant phenomenon in the twentieth century is the confrontation between the Free World (Capitalist ideology) and the communist regimes. When the Soviet Union collapsed in 1990, many Westerners relaxed and thought the fight was over. But it is not. The Chinese Communist Party (CCP) carried on the communist flag and continued the struggle, sometimes in subtle and sometimes in overt ways, against the West.

It was not until recently that the U.S. achieved better realization of the dangers from communist China. In fact, Beijing has been, for many years, quietly taking on the Free World on many fronts: military, space, trade, technology, the economy, cyber, diplomacy, and also, in a rarely noticed area – culture.

The fact that the CCP's cultural invasion of the West hasn't received much attention can be attributed to a few reasons: First, in the West, it is generally private companies that carry out cultural activities; the government is rarely directly involved. Second, due to major cultural differences between the West and China, the West may not have planned to use culture as a mean to influence China and promote a change in ideology. Consequently, it may not have expected the CCP to do so, either.

Nevertheless, Beijing has attributed great importance to the issue of culture.

The competition between the capitalist world and the communist world is fairly comprehensive. Beijing has recognized that, in the modern era, using culture to conquer an opponent is more powerful than military war.

Thus, the CCP adopted the "Culture Going Global" strategy. It became one of its top strategies starting in 2009, when Beijing first heavily promoted the "China Model." Two of the CCP's guiding principle documents further solidified this strategy: "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Deepening Reform of the Cultural System and Promoting the Great Development and Flourishing of Socialist Culture" in 2011 and "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Comprehensively Deepening Reform" in 2013.

Under that strategy, the CCP exports "communist culture" to the world (Hereinafter, when the CCP refers to Chinese culture or to traditional Chinese culture, what it actually means is the CCP culture or Chinese culture with communist characteristics). First, it focuses on "telling the China story," to let people accept the CCP's side of its story and accept "Chinese culture." Then over time, it builds up its soft power and eventually gains international discourse power and cultural and ideology dominance.

"Culture Going Global" "is a major measure China uses to compete for global discourse power." {1}

The "Culture Going Global" strategy complements the CCP's two other major strategies: The Belt and Road Initiative and the Community of Mankind's Shared Future.

Beijing implements the "Culture Going Global" strategy in a holistic approach. It mobilizes the whole nation, with the government playing a vital role, to implement it.

The involvement of the party organs and government offices includes:

- Creating policies
- Providing funding support and subsidies
- Establishing various intergovernmental cultural exchanges and cultural-related leagues
- Utilizing Chinese embassies and consulates, China's Cultural Centers, Confucius Institutes, and the Chinese diaspora
- Pushing state-owned media to go abroad
- Encouraging Chinese cultural enterprises to invest in or acquire companies overseas.

To the CCP, achieving cultural dominance is not for money; it is rather for the security of what it calls its ideology, for system security, and for the CCP's dominance of the world. The CCP is willing to back up its stance with the entire pool of the nation's resources, including money, people, the state judicial system, and all state powers. Therefore, it has the capacity to influence or force any private company or organization in the West to succumb to its demands.

I. CCP's "Cultural Going Global (文化走出去)" Strategy

The communist theory is based on atheist theory and class struggle. Its ideology is irreconcilable with the capitalist ideology and universal values. Therefore, from the communist point of view, a true "win-win" situation, or real co-existence between the capitalist world and the communist world is not possible. The CCP's mission is to replace the "old" world with the new communist world.

The Manifesto of the Communist Party stated, "The Communists' disdain to conceal their views and aims. They openly declare that their ends can be attained only by the forcible overthrow of all existing social conditions. Let the ruling classes tremble at a Communistic revolution. The proletarians have nothing to lose but their chains. They have a world to win." {2}

Therefore, the CCP's adopting a market economy over the past few decades did not mean that it wanted to live with the capitalist world. It was merely buying time to build up its own power, so that it can defeat its opponent when the time comes.

The CCP mistakenly thought that its time had come when, in 2008, the financial crisis hit the U.S. and the rest of the Free World. As China's economy remained largely intact, the CCP proudly talked about the superiority of China's socialist system and promoted the "China Model" to the world. It declared the end of Francis Fukuyama's "end of history" theory. {3} The CCP proudly stated, "The history of capitalism has not yet ended, but it is getting closer to its end; the history of socialism has not ended either – it not only survives strongly in a crisis, but is also recognized by more and more people in the world." {4}

It is important that our readers keep this context in mind when trying to understand Beijing's "Culture Going Global" strategy: that Beijing does not want co-existence with the rest of the world but rather dominance over all others.

A. The Significance of Culture

Culture claims a very high position in communist theory. It is a key foundation of the socialist or communist system.

"In Marx's view, culture is the deeper factor that influences the social system. The social system, during its development, tends to evolve into a cultural concept." {5}

Mao Zedong stated, "Culture not only reflects but can also guide political fighting and economical struggle. Culture is indispensable for the development of any society." {6}

Therefore, the CCP's recent guiding principle document "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Comprehensively Deepening Reform," passed at the CCP's Third Plenum of the 18th Party Congress on November 12, 2013, listed culture in the third position among six major areas to work on: the economic system, political system, cultural system, social system, ecological civilization system, and party development. {7}

Moreover, the CCP raises culture as a secret weapon, in its war to take over the world. To win the battle, everything can be used, and everything should be used. Thus, culture, in the CCP's eyes, is not just an art, custom, or social form that people created or formed, but rather a powerful weapon in its battle against the rest of the world.

"With a culture war unfolding on the boundless battlefield in the information age, the traditional army and weapons are no longer able to provide national security at the grand strategic level, nor can they safeguard national interests and sovereignty. War is now beyond the scope of the military. It is, more and more, becoming the work of politicians, philosophers, cultural leaders, scientists, and even bankers. This is the culture war in the globalizing information era." {8}

"In the future war, the status and role of culture are increasingly prominent. The dazzling victorious crown often belongs to the side with superior culture." {9}

The CCP theorists also pointed out the importance of culture in the soft power and diplomacy competition, and thus generating the global influence.

"Military struggle and economic trade reflect the countries' hard power; whereas culture exchange and civilization interaction represent each one's soft power." {10}

The "'Culture Going Global' strategy is not just a culture strategy, but more a political strategy. It is a major measure for China to compete for global discourse power. It is a major measure to safeguard China's culture security and ideology security, under non-traditional-security threats." {11}

"Culture can change people's thoughts in subtle ways. It is the highest form of conquest. Only by further implementing a 'Culture Going Global' strategy, can we obtain favorable position in international contest." {12}

"In the current world, if a country's culture is at the center position, other countries will automatically get closer to it; once a country's value system and diplomatic policies dominate the world order, that country will for sure become the world's leader. Therefore, today and in the future, the world competition mainly takes place in the culture field." {13}

B. Strategy

The CCP's cultural strategy is simple: "Culture Going Global." It involves exporting "red culture" or the communist ideology to the world.

This "Culture Going Global" strategy was first raised in the middle of 1990s. In the early 2010s, two of CCP's prominent guiding principle documents defined this strategy as the center piece of CCP's culture work.

The first guiding principle document, "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Deepening Reform of the Cultural System and Promoting the Great Development and Flourishing of Socialist Culture," was passed by the CCP's Sixth Plenum of the 17th Party Congress on October 18, 2011. {14} It listed the following methods used to "promote Chinese culture around the world":

- Develop multi-channel, multi-format, and multi-level cultural exchanges. Participate in world civilization dialog, promote culture exchanges, improve Chinese culture's appeal and influence in the world, and maintain the diversity of culture.
- Innovate overseas propaganda method, improve international discourse power, properly respond to external concerns, improve the international communities' better understanding of China's basic national conditions, values, development path, and internal and external policies, and demonstrate China's civilization, democracy, openness, and progress.
- Carry out "Culture Going Global" project, enhance policies to support cultural products and services to go abroad, support key main stream media to set up branches overseas, develop a group of competitive cultural enterprises and agencies, and improve support mechanism on translation, promotion, and consultation (for foreign market), to develop international cultural market.
- Strengthen the development of overseas China Cultural Centers and Confucius Institutes, encourage (China's) academia groups and arts organizations to constructively affect international organizations, and organize the translation of Chinese academic research and cultural products into foreign languages.
- Construct culture exchange mechanisms: utilize both government sponsored exchanges and private exchanges, leverage the influence of non-state-owned cultural enterprises and non-profit cultural organizations in overseas culture exchange, and support Chinese diaspora overseas to conduct exchange.

• Establish culture exchange mechanism for youths in other countries and set up Chinese culture international promotion award and international level cultural awards.

The second guiding principle document, "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Comprehensively Deepening Reform" was passed on November 12, 2013. {15} It outlined the "Culture Going Aboard" strategy in item #41 "Improve the level of cultural openness":

- Adhere to (the strategy of) "the government to set direction, companies to implement, market to operate, and society to participate." Adhere to expanding cultural exchanges and strengthening the development of international communication capabilities and discourse power, to push Chinese culture to the world.
- Coordinate the internal propaganda and overseas propaganda systems. Support key media to expand both internally and overseas.
- Develop cultural enterprises for overseas markets and support cultural enterprises in developing overseas markets.
- Encourage social organizations and state-funded institutions to participate in the development of Confucius Institutes and overseas cultural centers, to carry out cultural exchange programs.

C. The Goal

The CCP's goal is to use communist ideology to rule the world. One part of that rule is to use communist culture to gain dominance over the world.

"Building leadership power over culture is one of the CCP's cultural missions." {16}

However, Beijing knows very well that it will not be able to achieve dominance immediately; it has to establish its cultural leadership position step by step.

"Antonio Francesco Gramsci, an Italian Marxist philosopher and communist politician, believed that communists cannot win over the West in a quick battle. They should carry on the long-term battle and win gradually. Proletariats should first become the (cultural) leaders so as to become the (cultural) rulers in the end. They should conduct cultural and ideological battles and gradually grab the cultural leadership position." {17}

The strategic goal of the first step that many CCP scholars mentioned is to "tell the China story," or to let the rest of the world accept the CCP's side of the story. "Cultural communication is the way to communicate China's wisdom and China's story effectively. Obtaining a greater measure of the world's understanding and recognition has become an indispensable part of China's national strategy." {18}

The second step is to use culture to build up the CCP's soft power over time. "Culture is more and more prominent in international politics and plays an important role. Cultural diplomacy is the most effective way in the international soft power competition." {19}

A *Study Times* article suggested the culture development targets needed to "become a country with strong cultural competitiveness by 2050" and "to become one of the top-ranking countries in cultural competitiveness by 2100." {20}

Then, the ultimate goal is to use communist values to dominate the international order.

The State Council Information Office (国务院新闻办公室), also known as the International Communication Office of the CCP Central Committee (中共中央对外宣传办公室), explained what it called "the two meanings" of "Culture Going Global": {21}

"China's Culture Going Global' has two meanings. The first one is the direct meaning or what people normally think it is, with the goal to let people from other countries understand and become familiar with Chinese culture. Our setting up Confucius Institutes and teaching the Chinese language, translating Chinese writings into other languages, sending cultural groups and individuals for visits and exchanges, and similar activities are all for this purpose.

"The second meaning is a deeper one. It relates to people's value systems. The goal is to let people from other countries understand and accept China's values. It is, through cultural exchanges, to let people understand and accept Chinese culture. The key to accepting Chinese culture is to accept its values.

"Obviously, the two meanings of 'China's Culture Going Global' actually represent the two stages or two levels of 'Culture Going Global.' The second meaning must be established on the foundation of the first one."

D. Using Culture to Promote CCP Initiatives

Many articles in Chinese media have discussed the connection of the "Culture Going Global" strategy to the CCP's two prominent frameworks: The Belt and Road Initiative (BRI) (一带一路战略) and the Community of Mankind's Shared Future (人类命运共同体).

1. The Connection to the BRI

Initially the BRI targeted countries along the "Silk Road Economic Belt" and the "21st-century Maritime Silk Road." Beijing has also been pushing countries not on the route to join the BRI. Chinese media have used the BRI as a broader reference to conduct economic development and cultural exchanges around the world.

Chinese scholars view the BRI and "Culture Going Global" as being mutually beneficial to each other.

On one hand, the BRI provides a platform for Beijing to carry out its "Culture Going Global" strategy. On the other hand, the "Culture Going Global" strategy offers cultural programs for Beijing to implement the BRI within targeted countries and strengthen connections with them. In the end, the "Culture Going Global" strategy will implant the CCP's values in those countries and "secure China's long-lasting influence (over them)." {22}

"The BRI not only provides an opportunity for economic development, but also offers a golden opportunity for Chinese culture to go global. Only when we push our culture globally, can we let the world understand China's values, demonstrate our confidence in choosing the Socialist Path with Chinese Characteristics, and use China's discourse power to fix the Western prejudice and international community's misunderstanding of China." {23}

"The BRI strategy can be called China's 'smart power' strategy, because it allows China not only to harvest historical influences over those countries, but also to reconstruct the global community's recognition of Chinese culture. China can leverage the joint economic development practices and common views with those countries, refresh their recognition of China's culture and secure China's long-lasting influence (over them). {24}

"To obtain the global status matching its economic, political, and military power, China must develop its own global media and new communication order. The BRI provides an unprecedented opportunity for China to develop this global communication infrastructure during its process of building a global supply chain, cash flow channel, and resource flow channel." {25}

"The BRI uses culture to connect history, the present, and the future together. It is a strategic framework for China to go global. Culture is the soul of the BRI.

"The Cultural industry has three strategic positions in BRI. First, to make China's proposal (of BRI) the consensus of the international community; the most important pre-condition of that is to achieve consensus on culture and the recognition of (China's) value, via the culture industry's work. Second, the consensus on culture is the foundation for BRI. It is dependent on comingling the cultural values (of China and targeted countries) and establishing new values. Third, culture and the culture industry can be the breakthrough and key projects to start BRI." "The strategic value and effect of the culture industry (to BRI) is no less than what the infrastructure buildup is to telecommunication." {26}

2. The Connection to the Community of Mankind's Shared Future

Xi Jinping first mentioned the "Community of Mankind's Shared Future" (also translated as "Community of Mankind's Destiny") in 2013. This term is often used to guide the CCP's diplomatic practice. Under this concept, the CCP promotes a "new relationship between countries" – to establish a new world order and break away from the current Western dominated system. It emphasizes economic development and avoids discussion of ideology and universal values (since the CCP cannot openly sell its communist ideology and values to the world yet). It also promotes regional development and security cooperation to build up Beijing's influence over its neighboring countries.

Xi's speech at the United Nations on September 30, 2015, revealed the CCP's agenda to reduce the influence of the U.S. and the West and to defend and promote the communist system: "All countries are equals. The big, strong and rich should not bully the small, weak and poor." "The

principle of sovereignty ... also means that all countries' rights to choose their social systems and development paths independently should be upheld." {27}

An article explained how the cultural exchange can help China to build the "Community of Mankind's Shared Future." "Further expansion of cultural exchanges can help explain the concept of the 'Community of Mankind's Shared Future' to the world and let people from all countries accept this concept." "Deeper cultural exchanges can mingle China's experiences, oriental wisdom, and humankind's ideals together. This will build up the discourse vocabulary and system for the 'Community of Mankind's Shared Future' and make it truly the leading ideological product that the CCP provides to the world." {28}

II. Whose Culture to Promote?

One may ask why the rest of the world should be concerned with Beijing's "Culture Going Global" strategy. Isn't Chinese culture a culture that has been passed down over thousands of years with a rich heritage and a wealth of wisdom in understanding the relationships between the human and the divine and human and human?

Well, the traditional Chinese culture is, but the CCP's culture is not. The "culture" that the CCP promotes to the world is the "socialist culture," or the "red culture." It is totally different from traditional Chinese culture.

The CCP Central Committee's doctrine declared that its culture is under Marxist ideology and the CCP's leadership: "To construct a socialist culture power state and improve the state culture's soft power, (we) must adhere to the socialist advanced cultural direction, adhere to the Socialist Path of Chinese Characteristics, develop and practice socialist core values, strengthen Marxism's guiding position over ideology, ..." {29}

"What types of culture does our party and our people have? One is the traditional Chinese culture; the other one is the culture created by our party and people, or the revolutionary culture and the socialist advanced culture, which we normally call the 'red culture.'" "The traditional Chinese culture, once it has gone through the party's innovative transformation, will change into 'red culture,' too." {30}

A. Differences between the Two Cultures

There are several differences between the traditional Chinese culture and the CCP's culture.

The normal understanding of culture has at least two aspects. It inherits from the past (has a traditional aspect) and it carries human values and moral codes.

Traditional Chinese Culture has a deep interpretation of the relationship between the human world and the divine. Chinese believed that there were higher beings; that man should follow these higher beings; and that, through cultivation practice, man could reach the level of the divine. China's three main religious teachings, Taoism, Buddhism, and Confucianism, either originated in China or took root there about two thousand years ago. Many Chinese legends of

the divine dated even further before them. All of these flourished and were promulgated in a land whose people were devoted to achieving a oneness with heaven. They, in turn, established and supported the maintenance of a system of high moral standards in China.

The "communist culture," on the other hand, does not have any element of divinity. The CCP educates all Chinese that there is no divine power and bans all religions. Instead, it promotes itself to the Chinese people as "god" and its ideology and the words of its "supreme leader" as the equivalent of the holy bible. Thus, it tried to cut the people's ties to their traditional Chinese culture. From the 1950s to the Cultural Revolution (1966 – 1976), the CCP destroyed almost all Buddhist, Taoist, and Christian religions in China, including temples, churches, clergymen, believers, and practices. It still allowed a few religious practice groups, but that was for decorative purpose. Recently, it also rebuilt many temples, but that was for tourist purposes, not for cultivation.

The destruction of traditional Chinese culture also led to severe moral crises and corruption in China.

Chinascope's "The Battle for Man's Soul – Preface" article {31} contrasted the differences as follows:

There was once this great land on earth, where people believed they were at the center of the earth and blessed by the divine, and thus called their land the "Central Kingdom (中国)" and the "Land of the Divine (神州);

There was once a great civilization on this land, which began when, 5,000 years ago, the Yellow Emperor united different tribes and established the first civilization;

There was once a great culture on this land, which flourished during the period of "hundreds of schools of thought" 2,500 years ago, including Laozi, Confucius, Mencius, Sun Tzu (the author of "The Art of War"), Han Fei Zi (founder of "Chinese Legalism"), and other philosophers. Further enriched by imported Buddhism 2,000 years ago, it thus became the traditional Chinese culture that emphasizes the relationship between heaven and man, virtue, and order, with its roots firmly set in Buddhism, Daoism, and Confucianism;

There was once a great culture on this land, under which people held a high respect for human moral standards and believed in "giving up one's life for righteousness (舍生取义)," "a promise weighs heavier than one thousand pieces of gold (一诺千金)," "there are certain things that a gentleman must do and certain things that a gentleman must not do (大丈夫有所为有所不为)," and "do not do to others what you would not want them to do to you (己所不欲勿施于人);"

Sadly, under the CCP's reign, this once great land lost its religions as the CCP believes no gods exist and there is no power higher than communism: temples were destroyed, books of scripture were burned, and monks were forced to get married;

Sadly, under the CCP's reign, this once great land has lost its traditional culture: people are cheating and lying about everything, . . .

Sadly, under the CCP's reign, this once great land adopted unfair economic practices... by forcing foreign companies to hand over their intellectual property and technical knowhow, and by openly stealing over cyberspace;

Sadly, under the CCP's reign, this once great land attempts to extend its control over the world by buying underdeveloped countries and infiltrating developed countries, in a covert political and ideological campaign against the world;

Sadly, under the CCP's reign, this once great land has become a place to destroy people's conscience and man's soul and it keeps exporting that destruction to other countries.

B. The Danger of the CCP's Culture

The essence of the CCP culture, no matter how the communist party tries to package it, is to secure its power and its interests over its own people and ultimately, the world. The CCP will do anything to keep itself in power.

George Orwell said, "The peculiarity of the totalitarian state is that, though it controls thought, it does not fix it. It sets up unquestionable dogmas, and it alters them from day to day. It needs the dogmas, because it needs absolute obedience from its subjects, but cannot avoid the changes, which are dictated by the needs of power politics." {32}

In other words, the CCP, likewise, has no principles except the "absolute obedience from its subjects." The CCP knows that its political power is illegitimate, so it has repeatedly barked about "stability" and desired to protect its political power. Nevertheless, from time to time, it has changed its "communist values" and "communist ideology" for political need. For example, when the CCP first took power in China in 1949, it declared capitalists and landlords were the enemies of the proletariat and conducted "socialist reform" to eliminate them. Thirty years later, it reversed the course to carry out economic reform, allowing private business and encouraging people to get rich. Former CCP head Jiang Zemin even put forward the "Three Represents" theory. {33} It allowed capitalists to join the CCP. Starting in 2018, the CCP changed its direction again to restrict private ownership and promote public ownership.

The socialist values that the CCP teaches people have had a negative impact: to fight each other following the communist party's struggle theory, to lie along with the party, and to "be an obedient tool of the party." Over time, CCP culture cannot stand up in front of traditional Chinese culture or the Western culture and universal values.

How can the CCP convince the people in China and around the world to accept it then?

The Epoch Times gave a good explanation. {34}

"There are several ways a scoundrel might make others view him in a more positive light. One way would be to start from within, abandon evil, become good, and stop being a scoundrel. Other people would then over time naturally come to recognize the transformation.

"The second way would be to begin exerting pressure on others, trying to brainwash them into not recognizing the scoundrel for what he is.

"Finally, a scoundrel might even mount the most audacious plan, and attempt to use manipulation, lies, gaslighting, and brainwashing to turn everyone else into scoundrels too. This would offer the greatest protection."

The second and third approaches are the CCP's "Culture Going Global" plan.

C. Examples

A few examples will help our readers to see whether the culture programs that Beijing exports are to share traditional Chinese culture with the world or to promote the CCP's culture.

1. Ballet Performance to Spread CCP Ideology

Beijing sent the ballet performance troupe "The Red Detachment of Women" (红色娘子军) to several Western cities including Washington, DC, New York, Madrid, and Melbourne. The main message of the performance was: Peasants lived miserable lives and the land owners who were the "class enemies exploited them;" the CCP came as their savior and liberated them; under the CCP's leadership, the liberated peasant women picked up guns to kill those "class enemies." {35}

There is not much traditional Chinese culture in this show. Instead it includes extensive praise of the CCP and promotion of its "class struggle" theory.

2. Cultural Trip to "Tell China Story"

The Association for the Promotion of the Peaceful Unification of China (APPUC, 中国和平统一促进会) is a "non-profit organization" under the CCP Central Committee's United Front Department. It organizes a group of news reporters from the overseas Chinese media to visit Tibet as a cultural event every year. "To foreign reporters, Tibet is even harder to visit than North Korea. However, these one dozen reporters had a smooth trip and the local CCP officials also received them."

The Deputy Secretary Hao Yanfeng of the APPUC said the purpose of the trip was "to support the state's anti-Tibet separation work, especially the work against the Tibet separation force overseas." He encouraged the managers of those media to "spread well (the CCP's propaganda) about Tibet" and let the overseas Chinese feel "that without the CCP, Tibet would never have achieved what it has today."

After the tour, one reporter wrote "it is of significant meaning to witness the rebirth of such a poor and backward region (as Tibet)." Another reporter wrote, "Under the blue sky is the religious practice that anyone can easily obtain. Peaceful and secular temples have built the happiest world in the hearts of the Tibetans." {36}

3. Educational Exchange to Impose CCP's Views

Beijing has conducted many exchange and cooperation programs with the U.S. colleges. A 153-page report by the *Wilson Center* {37} indicated that these exchanges are aimed to build "China's political agenda and educational culture on American campuses." "(M)any Americans see the People's Republic of China's (PRC's) moves as those of a peer competitor aiming to create a world antithetical to U.S. values and interests" and to inculcate the "proper" attitude toward communist China in the minds of the academic community.

The report's Executive Summary lists a number of the PRC's deliberate actions. To name a few:

- Complaining to the university about invited speakers and events
- Pressuring and/or offering inducements to faculty whose work involves content deemed sensitive by the PRC authorities
- Demanding faculty alter their language or teaching materials involving sensitive content on political rather than evidence-based grounds
- Interrupting and heckling other members of the university community who engage in critical discussion of China
- Pressuring universities to cancel academic activities involving sensitive content
- Engaging in intimidation, abusive conduct, or harassment of other members of the university community

4. Confucius Institutions Must Align with the Party

Confucius was a great philosopher in China. The CCP denounced him during the Cultural Revolution, but borrowed his name, in the past two decades, to spread Confucius Institutes, a Chinese language "teaching and exchange" program, around the world.

However, its goal is not to spread the pure traditional Chinese culture, but rather the CCP's ideology. As Li Changchun, former CCP Politburo Standing Committee member stated, "Using the excuse of teaching the Chinese language, everything looks reasonable and logical."

The institution is strictly managed under the party's control. Teachers are checked for their correct "political thinking" before being hired. Sonia Zhao, a Confucius Institute teacher at the McMaster University in Canada reported that practitioners of Falun Gong, a religious group that the CCP has banned since 1999, were not allowed to work at Confucius Institution.

"(T)hey do tell us: Don't talk about (issues of Tibet or other sensitive topics). If the student insists, you just try to change the topic, or say something the Chinese Communist Party would prefer." {38}

III. Government Policies for "Culture Going Global"

Since the "Culture Going Global" is a top-level strategy for the CCP, many party organs and state agencies are working on this effort and creating policies for its implementation.

A. Government Organizations

Several party organs and state agencies are involved in the CCP's culture expansion. The leading entity is the Publicity Department of the CCP Central Committee (中央宣传部). It used to be called the Central Propaganda Department. Several of the Central Publicity Department's functions are related to culture:

- At the macro level, direct the production of spiritual products.
- Under the CCP Central Committee's assignment, assist the CCP Central Committee's Organization Department to manage the leading cadres of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, General Administration of Press and Publication, and Chinese Academy of Social Science; jointly work with the Organization Department to manage the leading cadres of *People's Daily*, the National Radio and Television Administration, and *Xinhua News Agency*; ...
- Be responsible for providing guiding principles for propaganda and culture development, overseeing propaganda and the culture system to establish policies and regulations, and coordinating various (party and government) organs within the propaganda and culture system. {39}

The Ministry of Culture and Tourism (文化和旅游部) of the State Council (国务院) is the main execution body. One of its function is to "guide and manage the exchange, cooperation, and promotion of culture and tourism work with foreign countries and Hong Kong, Macao, or Taiwan; guide cultural and tourism units stationed in foreign countries and Hong Kong, Macao, or Taiwan; sign, on behalf of China, cultural and tourism cooperation agreements between China and other countries; organize large-scale cultural and tourism exchange activities with foreign countries and Hong Kong, Macao, and Taiwan; promote Chinese culture to go global." {40}

The State Council Information Office (SCIO, 国务院新闻办公室) has the duty to "push Chinese media to explain China to foreign countries, guide and coordinate news reporting that targets foreign countries; organize comprehensive, multi-department, multi-region, large-scale culture exchange activities, and organize the production of books, audio and video, files and television publications that introduce China to foreign countries." SCIO and the International Communication Office of the CCP's Central Committee (中共中央对外宣传办公室) are the same entity with different names. {41}

The Ministry of Commerce (商务部) is partly involved as it oversees Chinese cultural companies' investing overseas and sending employees performing overseas. {42}

Both the Ministry of Finance (财政部) and People's Bank of China (中国人民银行) provide financial support to build cultural enterprises in China and supply foreign currency for overseas

investments. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs (外交部) supports Chinese performance troupes and culture exchange programs via its embassies and consulates overseas. The Ministry of Information Industry (信息产业部) supports the animation and other IT entertainment industries. The Ministry of Education (教育部) teaches the Chinese language overseas and offers scholarship to bring students from other countries to attend Chinese universities. The National Radio and Television Administration (国家广播电视总局) oversees the radio, movie and TV businesses. The Overseas Chinese Affairs Office (OCAO) of the State Council (国务院侨务办公室) sends performance troupes around the world and conducts outreach to the Chinese diaspora. The All-China Federation of Returned Overseas Chinese (中华全国归国华侨联合会(中国侨联)), which claims to be a "non-governmental" organization, but actually works under the International Department of the CCP Central Committee (中央对外联络部(中联部)), also sends performance troupes around the world.

The General Administration of Press and Publication (GAPP, 国家新闻出版署) oversees the press and publications. It used to be an independent office under the State Council. Now it is under the Publicity Department of the CCP Central Committee, keeping only a name plate for the state agency.

B. Government Policies

The following are some major government policies issued since 2009, related to the "Culture Going Global" strategy:

July 22, 2009: The State Council passed the "Cultural Industry Revitalization Plan." {43} It is a milestone plan that marked the beginning of Beijing's aggressive culture exports. The plan listed five major policy measures:

- Lower the entry barrier to allow non-government capital and foreign capital to invest in the culture industry.
- Increase government investment, from both the central government and all levels of local government, offering low interest loans, project subsidies, and other means to encourage cultural product and service exports; increase special funding for the culture industry.
- Provide tax incentives.
- Increase the financial support from the banking system, such as offering insurance and reinsurance, support culture enterprises to make IPOs or issue bonds.
- Establish the China Culture Industrial Investment Fund.

July 31, 2009: The CCP Central Committee's Publicity Department and the Ministry of Culture jointly issued "Several Opinions on Deepening Reform of State-Owned Cultural Performance Troupes." It set the policy to convert state-owned performance troupes to commercial companies (the government can hold shares). It stated it would "emphasize developing backbone performing troupes." "Choose certain large state-owned or state-holding companies that have good growth potentials and strong competitiveness, to increase the level of support for them and encourage them to leverage funding to conduct cross-region acquisition and re-organization so as to develop both domestic and foreign markets." {44}

From March 2009 to March 2010: The Ministry of Culture signed culture industry development cooperation agreements with the Bank of China, the China Export-Import Bank, and the Industrial and Commercial Bank of China (ICBC), to get their commitment to provide financial support to culture enterprises. {45} {46} {47}

March 19, 2010: The Ministry of Culture, the Bank of China, and the Ministry of Finance jointly issued "The Guiding Opinion on Financial Support for the Culture Industry's Revitalization and Development." The opinion requested better foreign currency support for domestic culture enterprises to invest overseas. {48}

August 26, 2010: The National Radio and Television Administration signed a "Cooperation Agreement to Support Key Companies to Export Radio, Film, and Television Programs" with the China Export-Import Bank, to secure financial support with foreign currency. {49}

April 20, 2011: The General Administration of Press and Publication published "The Development Plan for the Press and Publication Industry in the 12th Five-Year Plan Period." It called for "creating a group of large media groups and supply chain enterprises that can compete internationally." It set the goal of US\$ 42 million in publication product exports and US\$1 billion in exports of digital publication products and services by 2015. {50}

October 18, 2011: The CCP published its guiding strategic doctrine "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Deepening Reform of the Cultural System and Promoting the Great Development and Flourishing of Socialist Culture." {51}

September 21, 2012: The Ministry of Commerce, the Publicity Department of the CCP Central Committee, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Culture, and the National Radio and Television Administration jointly issued "The 2011-2012 Index of Key Companies and Key Projects for Culture Exports," listing key culture companies for the state to support. {52}

September and October 2013: Xi Jinping put forward the concept of the BRI.

February 26, 2014: The State Council issued "Several Opinions of the State Council Pertaining to Advancing Cultural Creative Idea and Design Services Relevant Industry." It called to "support companies to 'go global,' to expand the export of products and services, and to develop international markets actively via overseas mergers and acquisitions, joint ventures, and establishing its own branches." {53}

March 3, 2014: The State Council issued the "Opinion of the State Council Pertaining to Accelerating the Development of Cultural Trade Overseas." {54} It listed several policies to encourage culture exports:

• Encourage all types of companies, via establishing overseas branches, mergers and acquisitions, and joint ventures, to invest in the culture industry overseas and to develop an international sales network. Promote the development of trading platforms for cultural products and services exports and support cultural enterprises to participate in important

- international cultural exhibitions. Encourage cultural enterprises to develop international business via e-commerce.
- Cultural enterprises conducting outsourcing services can enjoy fifteen percent of business income tax relief and employees can enjoy up to an eight percent of tax deduction on training and education expenses.
- Support state-owned key culture export enterprises to raise money via company bond and non-financial instrument. Provide conveniences for small to mid-sized cultural companies to utilize financing instruments such as medium-term notes, short-term financing bills, collection notes, and private placement bonds. Support qualified cultural export projects to issue non-financial, corporate asset-backed notes and securities company's asset securitization products. Encourage cultural enterprises with cross-border investment needs to issue foreign currency bonds in China. Support cultural export enterprises to issue bonds in overseas RMB markets such as Hong Kong within the quota approved by the State Council.

March 17, 2014: The Ministry of Culture, the Bank of China, and the Ministry of Finance jointly issued "The Opinion Pertaining to Deepening Culture and Finance Cooperation." {55} The opinion listed a number of financial support mechanisms for cultural enterprises, including:

- Establish and improve a cultural finance intermediary service system.
- Explore the creation of cultural finance cooperation pilot zone.
- Accelerate the innovation of credit products and services suitable for cultural enterprises.
- Improve the credit management mechanism of cultural enterprises.
- Accelerate cultural enterprises' direct financing.
- Develop and promote financial products and services suitable for cultural trade overseas.
- Increase financial support for consumption of cultural products.
- Promote the integration of cultural industries and related industries.
- Innovate new methods of cultural asset management.

The opinion further stated that these three government entities would establish an interministerial consultation mechanism for cultural finance cooperation. The central government would allocate special funds for cultural finance cooperation and implement a "Cultural Finance Support Plan."

July 11, 2014: The Ministry of Culture, the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, and the Ministry of Finance jointly issued the "Implementation Opinions Pertaining to Supporting the Development of Small and Micro-Cultural Enterprises." {56}

August 8, 2014: The Ministry of Culture and the Ministry of Finance jointly issued the "Guiding Opinions Pertaining to Promoting the Development of the Cultural Industry with Unique Cultural Product." It stated to "support enterprises with unique cultural products to participate in exhibitions and cultural exchange events overseas, to help them get into international market. Fully leverage the cultural offices (groups) of Chinese embassies and consulates and overseas Chinese cultural centers, to assist cultural enterprises in understanding and analyzing the overseas cultural markets and expand overseas marketing networks and channels." {57}

March 28, 2015: The National Development and Reform Commission, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and the Ministry of Commerce jointly issued the "Vision and Actions to Promote the Development of the Silk Road Economic Belt and the 21st Century Maritime Silk Road." {58} In addition to economic development, it called for:

- Wide cultural exchange, academic exchange, talent exchange, media cooperation, youth and female interaction, and volunteer services.
- Expand the exchange student program. Each year, China provides 10,000 government scholarships to each country along the route. Organize cultural year, art festival, film festival, TV week and book exhibitions, cooperate in the creation and translation of radio and film products, jointly apply for world cultural heritage, and jointly carry out joint protection of world heritage.
- Strengthen tourism cooperation, expand the scale of tourism, and organize a tourism promotion week, publicity month, and other activities. Jointly create international boutique tourism routes and tourism products with the characteristics of the Silk Road. Promote cruise cooperation on the 21st Century Maritime Silk Road. Actively carry out sports exchanges and support countries along the route to bid for major international sporting events.

December 30, 2016: The Ministry of Culture Issued the "Belt and Road' Cultural Development Action Plan (2016-2020)." This comprehensive plan lists Beijing's actions to conduct substantial culture exchanges and exports to the countries on the route, including creating six "silk road international alliances" of theaters, libraries, museums, art museums, art festivals, and art colleges, setting up Chinese Cultural Centers in partner countries, carry out a large number of cultural exchanges and tourism activities, and develop 800 scholars on Chinese study. {59}

April 20, 2017: The Ministry of Culture Issued the "Cultural Industry Development Plan During the 13th Five-Year Plan Period." It stressed developing the culture industry both domestically and overseas under the BRI, "to make the cultural Industry become a pillar industry of the national economy." It also promoted the "culture+" and "Internet+" strategy (combine other industries such as manufacturing, construction, design, information technology, tourism, and agriculture, on top of culture or the Internet." {60}

May 7, 2017: The General Office of the CCP Central Committee and the General Office State Council jointly published the "Outline of the National Cultural Development and Reform Plan during the 13th Five-Year Plan Period." It stated to "promote Chinese culture to go global and uniformly coordinate culture exchange, broadcast, and trade." "Support private forces to participate in culture exchanges and utilize the overseas Chinese diaspora. Encourage organizations and State-Owned Enterprises to take part in the development of China Cultural Centers and Confucius Institutes overseas." "Encourage all types of businesses to invest in the cultural industry overseas." "Support cultural enterprises to participate in important international cultural festivals." {61}

IV. The Strategic Implementation of "Culture Going Global"

Beijing has mobilized many resources, from state powers to private culture enterprises, to implement the "Culture Going Global" strategy.

A. Progress

The actual statistical numbers on Beijing's "Culture Going Global" implementation may not be readily available. However, we can still gain an understanding of how grandiose and comprehensiveness its effort has been.

David Shambaugh, in his article in *Foreign Affairs*, "China's Soft-Power Push," stated, "China's diplomatic and development schemes form just one part of a much broader agenda aimed at enhancing its soft power in media, publishing, education, the arts, sports, and other domains. Nobody knows for sure how much China spends on these activities, but analysts estimate that the annual budget for 'external propaganda' runs in the neighborhood of \$10 billion annually. By contrast, the U.S. Department of State spent \$666 million on public diplomacy in fiscal year 2014." {62}

One of China's strategies is to place a heavy emphasis on overseas investment in cultural and entertainment industries. According to the *American Enterprise Institute's (AEI's)* "China Global Investment Tracker," in a seven-year period between 2005 and 2011, China's overseas investment in the entertainment industry was \$1.22 billion. In the following seven-year period between 2012 and 2018, that number increased 40 times to \$47.77 billion. {63}

According to the "2017 China Performance Market Annual Report," overseas performances by Chinese performance troupes generated 2.97 billion yuan (US \$450 million) in 2017. {64} In 2009, those proceeds were only 77.8 million yuan. {65}

Two of the frequently mentioned "Culture Going Global" instruments in Beijing's official documents are building China Cultural Centers and Confucius Institutes overseas. By the end of 2017, Beijing had built 35 China Cultural Centers on 5 continents, including the cities of Dar es Salaam (a coastal city in Tanzania), Cairo, Paris, Berlin, Tokyo, and Tel Aviv. {66} Its goal is to build 50 centers by 2020. {67}

By end of year 2018, Beijing had established 548 Confucius Institutes and 1,193 Confucius Classrooms in 154 countries and regions on six continents. {68} Office of Chinese Language Council International (Hanban) aims to establish 1,000 Confucius Institutes by 2020. {69}

"China has become the world's number one in book publications, television program productions and broadcasts, and movie screens." {70} China had 55,623 movie screens by the first half of 2018. {71} It is 36 percent more than the 40,837 that the U.S. had by end of 2018. {72}

In addition, *The Heritage Foundation* reported that "China is taking control of Hollywood." China's large movie market and its financing of films and buying theater chains in the U.S. has given it huge leverage to tell Hollywood what to make and what to say. "It's not just censorship of Hollywood movies that are shown in the Chinese mainland. It's the censorship of Hollywood movies that are shown to American audiences." "U.S. scriptwriters and producers are beginning

to even preempt the censorship boards in China, and they're starting to write films that they know will be able to pass the test of China." {73}

B. Characteristics

Beijing's "Culture Going Global" strategy exhibits a few characteristics.

First, it is a holistic movement throughout the whole nation. From the National Ballet of China to the few jugglers and acrobats at the Busch Gardens theme park, groups big or small, state-owned or privately owned, all are keen on performing overseas. This is due to the CCP's powerful mobilization capability – once it sets a strategy and commits itself to it, it is able to mobilize cultural companies and performers to go along with it. Also, being able to perform overseas boosts the performer's credentials and therefore many companies or people are willing to perform for little proceeds or even pay out of their own pockets for the opportunity.

Second, the primary goal of this strategy is not to make money. Beijing puts this strategy at the political level and national security level. It has fully committed itself to this strategy and has the whole nation's gross domestic product as its backing.

Xi Jinping stated at the CCP's 19th National Congress in 2017, "We have made all-around efforts in the pursuit of major country diplomacy with Chinese characteristics, thus advancing China's diplomatic agenda in a comprehensive, multilevel, multifaceted way and creating a favorable external environment for China's development." "We must promote the creative evolution and development of fine traditional Chinese culture, make sure our revolutionary culture remains alive and strong, and develop an advanced socialist culture... We should do more to foster a Chinese spirit, Chinese values, and Chinese strength to provide a source of cultural and moral guidance for our people." {74}

Beijing has provided a lot of financial support and incentives for cultural companies to go abroad, including government funds, tax relief, government subsidies, and significant personal recognition and gratuities. But even if there were no financial benefits, many enterprises in China would still do it. That is because Chinese companies are required to be in line with the party's position and help out on national security work. In many cases, they volunteer to "tell the China story" to the world because they can be rewarded one way or the other at a later time, or they may have already received many "helps" from the government and it is the time for them to pay back what they have received.

Therefore, Wanda Group (also known as Dalian Wanda), whose success in real estate was inseparable from government support, bought AMC Theaters in the U.S.; Ma Yun, whose success with Alibaba also required government blessings, bought *South China Morning Post* in Hong Kong; DMG, whose founder Xiao Wenge is the son of a People's Liberation Army general, bought *Eastern Television* in Taiwan. {75}

Third, "Culture Going Global" is "China's Position in International Expression" (trying to tell the "China story" in a way that the local people will understand.) {76} To package the message for easy acceptance, *China Central Television (CCTV)* hires many Western news reporters and

anchors. Chinese companies also talked about "bringing in" first, for better "going global" later. For example, the Beiao Group, a large cultural/performing arts/sports company, worked with the National Theatre of China to bring in the popular British performance *War Horse* to create a version in the Chinese language. It thus learned a lot about script adaptation, stage design, actor training, marketing, and business operations. Beiao also worked with a French group to jointly develop a show *Le fil Rouge* and toured France. {77}

C. Strategic Approaches

The CCP drives the overall "Culture Going Global" strategy. The government plays a vital role in the funding and implementation of this strategy, way beyond what the U.S. or other Western countries can do or imagine.

The government's involvement includes, but is not limited to, the following means:

- 1. Providing government funding support and subsidies
 - In August 2010, the GAPP and the Export-Import Bank of China signed the "Cooperation Agreement to Support Key Enterprises and Projects in Culture Exports." During the five-year cooperation period, the Export-Import Bank of China planned to provide no less than 20 billion yuan RMB or equivalent foreign currency (US\$3 billion) to the key enterprises and projects to explore the international market. {78}
 - The Bank of China and the ICBC also signed similar agreements around the same time.
 - China's domestic performing arts market was 46.9 billion yuan (US\$7 billion). The government subsidized a quarter of it, or 12.0 billion yuan. The government also offered additional special benefits to farmers. {79}

2. Conducting intergovernmental cultural exchanges

Beijing arranges many art group visits, cultural year events, art festivals, antique exhibitions, and large-scale themed performances with other countries.

- The Overseas Chinese Affairs Office of the State Council started the "Cultures of China, Festivals of Spring (四海同春)" performance program in 2009. It sends performance troupes overseas during the Chinese New Year period. By 2018, it had sent 69 performance troupes to 144 countries in five continents. {80}
- The All-China Federation of Returned Overseas Chinese started organizing the "Embrace China (亲情中华)" culture exchanges in 2008. Its performance troupes have toured the world with more than 900 shows in ten years. It also organized other events such as art exhibitions, speech contests, writing contests, and tours in China, under the "Embrace China" theme. {81}
- There are many culture exchanges. For example, Beijing and Monaco had a relics exhibition exchange in 2017 and 2018. Monaco held the (China's) Forbidden City Cultural Relics Exhibition and China held the Monaco Grimaldi Dynasty Relics Exhibition. In 2018, Chengdu City of Sichuan Province held the Pompeii Relics Exhibition and Naples, Italy held the Old Sichuan Civilization Exhibit. {82}

3. Establishing leagues on cultural products and services exchanges

In the past five years, Beijing has formed the following eight international level leagues under the BRI name to exchange culture products and services:

- The Silk Road International League of Theaters (SRILT, 丝绸之路国际剧院联盟): Founded in Beijing in October 2016; it has 107 member units from 2 international organizations and 37 countries and regions around the world.
- The Silk Road International Alliance of Satellite Television (丝绸之路国际卫视联盟): Founded in Xi'an, Shaanxi Province in June 2017. {83}
- The Belt and Road Media Community (BRMC, 丝路电视国际合作共同体): It has 75 member units. {84}
- The Silk Road International Library Alliance (丝绸之路国际图书馆联盟): Founded in Chengdu, Sichuan Province, with 24 member libraries in May 2018. {85}
- The International Alliance of Museums of The Silk Road (丝绸之路国际博物院联盟): Founded in May 2017; it has 158 member units, including 47 international organizations and 111 domestic organizations. {86}
- The Silk Road International Alliance of Art Museums and Galleries (丝绸之路国际美术馆联盟): Founded in Beijing, with art galleries and key art institutions in 18 countries and regions, in June 2018. {87}
- The Network of Silk Road Art Festivals (丝绸之路国际艺术节联盟): Founded in Shanghai in October 2017. {88}
- The University Alliance of the Silk Road (丝绸之路大学联盟): Founded in Xi'an, Shaanxi Province in May 2015; it has 150 university members from 38 countries and regions. {89}

4. Chinese Embassies and Consulates' Promotions

Chinese Embassies and Consulates actively support and sometimes organize performances and cultural exchange programs in the countries where they reside.

- The Ministry of Culture and the Ministry of Finance jointly issued the "Guiding Opinions on Promoting the Development of the Cultural Industry with Unique Cultural Product" in 2014, stating the purpose to "fully leverage the cultural offices (groups) of Chinese embassies and consulates and overseas China Cultural Centers, to assist cultural enterprises in understanding and analyzing the overseas cultural markets and expand overseas marketing networks and channels." {90}
- In 2018, officials from China's Consulate in San Francisco attended and made speeches at over 20 opening night performances of performing troupes from China.
- Lu Fan, China's Ambassador to Spain, admitted that he had personally pressured the Royal Theater in Madrid into cancelling a performance that Shen Yun Performing Arts had booked there in January 2019. Shen Yun is an independent performance group based in the U.S. Its performances include classic Chinese dances and stories about religious cultivation that the CCP has banned in China. Reminding the Spanish theater that it had

become a member of the Silk Road International League of Theaters and luring it with the promise of China's great market potential, Lu convinced the theater to "consider the politics." {91}

5. Expanding giant state-owned media enterprises overseas

Unlike the Western countries, Beijing has many state-owned media enterprises. These media companies have played an aggressive role in expanding and spreading China's voice to the world.

In 2102, Chinascope did an in-depth report on the CCP's cultural expansion: {92}

- China Central Television (CCTV, 中央电视台) began its global expansion by starting with the Asia Pacific countries in 1992, and then expanded to the Europe in 1996, to Africa in 1997, and to the U.S. in 1998. It launched "CCTV America" from its studio in Washington, DC in 2012.
- China Radio International (CRI, 中国国际广播电台) started its Chinese broadcasting in the greater New York metropolitan area in 2009.
- English China Daily published China Daily, US edition in 2009.
- The Xinhua News Network Corporation (CNC, 新华网络电视) was founded in 2010 and launched its English channel in the same year. It attempted to build a news network rivaling CNN or BBC.
- Xinhua News Agency's ads have been displayed at Times Square since 2011.

Today, China's media expansion is getting deeper and wider:

- Beijing launched *China Global Television Network* (*CGTN*, 中国环球电视网), under *CCTV*, on December 31, 2016, as a multi-language and multi-platform media organization, operating on television and online. "Headquartered in Beijing, *CGTN* has an international team of professionals based around the world with production centers located in Nairobi, Washington D.C., and London." "*CGTN's* six TV channels English, Spanish, French, Arabic, Russian, and Documentary are available in more than 170 countries and regions worldwide." "*CGTN Digital* is accessible via *CGTN.com*, *CGTN* mobile applications, *YouTube*, *Facebook*, *Twitter*, *Weibo* and other social media platforms, with over 150 million followers across the globe." {93} In February 2019, the U.S. made *CGTN* register itself as a "foreign agent" in the U.S.
- On March 21, 2018, Beijing created another media super giant *China Media Group* (*CMG*, called "中央广播电视总台" in Chinese), by combining *CCTV*, *CRI*, *China National Radio* (*CNR*, 中央人民广播电台), and *CGTN*. According to a *CGTN* report, CMG "will be under the (CCP Central Committee's) Publicity Department." "(It is) tasked with better telling the country's stories to the world" and "also spreading the Party's guiding principles and policies." {94} CMG programs are called *Voice of China* (中国之声) in general.
- The China Arts and Entertainment Group Ltd. (CAEG, 中国对外文化集团有限公司) was founded in April 2004, by combining the China Performing Arts Agency (CPAA)

and China International Exhibition Agency (CIEA) which were established in 1957 and 1950, respectively. It is "China's only central state-owned cultural enterprise that has a performance and exhibition business worldwide." It is "the largest importer of international performances and exhibitions in China and the world's largest exporter of Chinese performances and exhibitions." "CAEG stages on average over 4,000 different kinds of performances, exhibitions and other cultural activities in over 200 cities in dozens of countries and regions, attracting over 10 million attendees every year." It is "under the guidance of 'starting from China and going global." {95}

6. Encouraging culture companies to invest overseas

Beijing pushes Chinese companies in the entertainment and cultural industries to invest overseas. Though most of these investments and acquisitions are done by individual companies, as we have explained earlier, it is impossible to claim that these actions are pure company decisions and are totally free from Beijing's influence.

- According to AEI's "China Global Investment Tracker," China's overseas investment in entertainment industry went through three phases: From 2007 to 2011, the total annual investment was less than \$500 million. From 2012 to 2016, it jumped to \$2-3 billion a year. The number further hiked to over \$7 billion in 2017 and 2018. {96}
- Since 2012, Wanda Group has spent nearly \$10 billion to acquire Legendary Entertainment, AMC, Carmike Cinemas, and Dick Clark Productions, producer of the Golden Globe Awards, and other firms. It became the largest chain cinema worldwide. Those acquisitions are backed by Beijing. "According to incomplete statistics, Wanda had borrowed at least \$10 billion from 2012 to 2016, mostly from Chinese banks." {97}

Ironically, however mighty the Wanda Group was (its Chairman Wang Jianlin had held the titles of the richest man in China and the richest Chinese in the world), it went south right away after Beijing disliked it. In 2017 and 2018, Wanda was forced to sell much of its real estate business, which was its core business, to other Chinese companies at cheap prices. {98} This shows that it is the government not the business itself or the market that determines the success or failure of a private business in China.

As we can see, the CCP is carrying on a cultural invasion around the world. Each government and all the world's people need to wake up before China's slow and steady infiltration leads us all to become vassals of communism.

Endnotes:

{1} The Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference website, "Regarding the Proposal of 'Culture Going Global," February 24, 2012.

http://www.cppcc.gov.cn/zxww/2012/02/24/ARTI1330051027449209.shtml.

- {2} Marxists.org, "Manifesto of the Communist Party," Chapter IV. https://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1848/communist-manifesto/.
- {3} The End of History and the Last Man, Francis Fukuyama, 1992.

In his book, Fukuyama argued that the advent of Western liberal democracy may signal the

endpoint of humanity's sociocultural evolution and the final form of human government. This is in direct contradiction to Marx's theory that communism would displace capitalism.

{4} *People's Daily*, "Comment on Fukuyama's End of History," September 29, 2009. http://theory.people.com.cn/GB/10136285.html.

{5} *Qiushi*, "Culture Confidence Is the Foundation for System Confidence and National Competition Power," February 23, 2017.

http://www.qstheory.cn/dukan/hqwg/2017-02/23/c 1120519510.htm.

{6} *The Collections of Mao Zedong, Third Volume*, "On the Culture and Education Issue at the Shaan-Gan-Ning Border Region," March 22, 1944.

http://cpc.people.com.cn/GB/64184/64185/189963/11567708.html.

{7} Xinhua, "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Comprehensively Deepening Reform," November 15, 2013.

http://www.sc.xinhuanet.com/content/2013-11/15/c 118164288.htm.

{8} Study Times, "Conquer without a War," November 23, 2009.

http://www.studytimes.com.cn/WebPage/ny1.aspx?act=1&id=3081&nid=11188&bid=7&page=1.

{9} *People's Daily*, "The Victory of War Is Determined by Culture," July 2, 2012. http://theory.people.com.cn/n/2012/0705/c49165-18449632.html.

{10} China Trade and Financial, "Examination of China's Soft Power under the BRI," February 2, 2017.

http://www.sinotf.com/GB/News/1003/2017-02-02/yNMDAwMDIxOTcyNg.html.

{11} The Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference website, "Regarding the Proposal of 'Culture Going Global," February 24, 2012.

http://www.cppcc.gov.cn/zxww/2012/02/24/ARTI1330051027449209.shtml.

{12} Perfect Dissertation, "Study of China's Culture Going Global Mechanism," November 17, 2017.

http://www.wmlunwen.com/guomaolunwen/201711172831.html.

{13} Qiushi, "Red Culture and Culture Confidence," June 23, 2017.

http://www.qstheory.cn/dukan/hqwg/2017-06/23/c_1121197124.htm.

{14} *People's Daily*, "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Deepening Reform of the Cultural System and Promoting the Great Development and Flourishing of Socialist Culture," October 18, 2011.

http://cpc.people.com.cn/GB/64093/64094/16018068.html.

{15} Xinhua, "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Comprehensively Deepening Reform," November 15, 2013.

http://www.sc.xinhuanet.com/content/2013-11/15/c 118164288.htm.

{16} *People's Daily*, "The CCP's 'Cultural Leadership' History," November 10, 2009. http://dangshi.people.com.cn/GB/144956/10350164.html.

{17} *People's Daily*, "The CCP's 'Cultural Leadership' History," November 10, 2009. http://dangshi.people.com.cn/GB/144956/10350164.html.

{18} *People's Daily*, "Cultural Communication: National Strategy Based on Culture Confidence," August 23, 2017.

http://theory.people.com.cn/n1/2017/0823/c40531-29488405.html.

{19} cnki.net, "Study of China's Cultural Diplomacy in the New Era."

http://kns.cnki.net/KCMS/detail/detail.aspx?dbcode=CMFD&dbname=CMFD201801&filename=1017237643.nh&v=MDAwNDFyQ1VSTE9mWnVSdEZpdm1XNy9PVkYyNkdiRzdHZGZJckpFYlBJUjhlWDFMdXhZUzdEaDFUM3FUcldNMUY=.

{20} *Study Times*, "The Strategic Choice for China's Cultural Modernization," May 25, 2009. http://www.studytimes.com.cn/WebPage/ny1.aspx?act=1&id=2667&nid=9674&bid=6&page=1.

{21} The State Council Information Office website, "The Two Meanings of China's Culture Going Global," October 10, 2016.

http://www.scio.gov.cn/zhzc/10/Document/1493276/1493276.htm.

{22} The Academy of Social Science of China website, "Communication over Culture in the BRI," June 24, 2016.

http://ex.cssn.cn/djch/djch_djchhg/yidaiyilu/201606/t20160624_3084157.shtml.

{23} The Academy of Social Science of China website, "BRI Helps Chinese Culture Going Global," November 7, 2017.

http://www.cssn.cn/zx/201711/t20171106 3718434.shtml.

{24} The Academy of Social Science of China website, "Communication over Culture in the BRI," June 24, 2016.

http://ex.cssn.cn/djch/djch_djchhg/yidaiyilu/201606/t20160624_3084157.shtml.

{25} ibid.

{26} China Economy, "Direction and Aspects of the Culture Industry's Development in BRI," March 28, 2015.

http://www.ce.cn/culture/gd/201503/28/t20150328 4962849.shtml.

{27} *Xinhua*, "Xin Jinping's Speech at the General Debate of the 70th United Nations General Assembly," September 29, 2015.

http://www.xinhuanet.com/world/2015-09/29/c 1116703645.htm.

{28} Sohu, "Jiang Li: Culture Exchange with Aspect to Building 'Community of Mankind's Shared Future," August 8, 2018.

http://www.sohu.com/a/245979750 100116571.

{29} Xinhua, "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Comprehensively Deepening Reform," November 15, 2013.

http://www.sc.xinhuanet.com/content/2013-11/15/c 118164288.htm.

{30} Qiushi, "Red Culture and Culture Confidence," June 23, 2017.

http://www.qstheory.cn/dukan/hqwg/2017-06/23/c 1121197124.htm.

{31} Chinascope, "The Battle for Man's Soul – Preface," September 1, 2018.

http://chinascope.org/archives/16037.

{32} George Orwell Library, "George Orwell Literature and Totalitarianism."

http://www.orwell.ru/library/articles/totalitarianism/english/e lat.

{33} The China Net website, "What Is the 'Three Represents' CPC Theory?"

http://french.china.org.cn/english/zhuanti/3represents/68735.htm.

{34} *The Epoch Times*, "How the Specter of Communism Is Ruling Our World - Chapter Eighteen: The Chinese Communist Party's Global Ambitions (Part II)."

https://www.theepochtimes.com/chapter-eighteen-the-chinese-communist-partys-global-ambitions-part-ii_2822429.html.

{35} *The Epoch Times*, "Red Ballet at Kennedy Center Becomes Focus of Controversy," October 1, 2015.

https://www.theepochtimes.com/red-ballet-at-kennedy-center-becomes-focus-of-controversy 1493710.html.

{36} VOA, "Free Trip to China Every Year and Bring the CCP's Propaganda to the World in Return," November 1, 2018.

https://www.voachinese.com/a/china-overseas-chinese-media-20181031/4637319.html.

{37} Wilson Center, "A Preliminary Study of PRC Political Influence and Interference Activities in American Higher Education."

https://www.wilsoncenter.org/sites/default/files/prc_political_influence_full_report.pdf.

{38} Inside Higher Education, "Confucius Institutes: Academic Malware and Cold Warfare," July 26, 2018

https://www.insidehighered.com/views/2018/07/26/confucius-institutes-function-propaganda-arms-chinese-government-opinion.

{39} *People's Daily*, "Main Functions (of the CCP Central Publicity Department)." http://cpc.people.com.cn/GB/64114/75332/5230610.html.

{40} The China Government website, "Functions and Staffing of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism," September 10, 2018.

http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/2018-09/10/content 5320818.htm.

{41} People's Daily, "Basic Information of SCIO."

http://cpc.people.com.cn/GB/64114/64139/6131588.html.

{42} The Ministry of Commerce website, "Main Functions of the Ministry of Commerce." http://www.mofcom.gov.cn/mofcom/zhize.shtml.

{43} Xinhua, "Cultural Industry Revitalization Plan," September 26, 2009.

http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2009-09/26/content 12114302.htm.

{44} The Hunan Province Government website, "The CCP Central Committee's Publicity Department and the Ministry of Culture: 'Several Opinions on Deepening Reform of State-Owned Cultural Performance Troupes," July 31, 2009.

http://wht.hunan.gov.cn/xxgk/zcfg/gjjfg/200907/t20090731 3845563.html.

{45} The China Government website, "The Ministry of Culture Signed Cooperation Agreement with the Bank of China," April 25, 2009.

http://www.gov.cn:8080/gzdt/2009-04/25/content 1295747.htm.

{46} *Xinhua*, "The China Arts and Entertainment Group and the China Export-Import Bank Agreed for Strategic Cooperation," November 27, 2009.

http://news.xinhuanet.com/society/2009-11/27/content 12551017.htm.

{47} The China Government website, "Notice by the Ministry of Commerce and the ICBC on Implementing Strategic Cooperation in the Culture Industry," May 7, 2010.

http://www.gov.cn/zwgk/2010-06/13/content 1627384.htm.

{48} The Ministry of Finance website, "The Guiding Opinion on Financial Support Culture Industry's Revitalization and Development," March 19, 2010.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/zhengcefabu/201004/t20100408 285177.htm.

{49} The China Government website, "Cooperation Agreement on Supporting Key Companies to Export Radio, Film, and Television," August 26, 2010.

http://www.gov.cn/jrzg/2010-08/26/content 1688978.htm.

{50} The GAPP Website, "The Development Plan for Press and Publication Industry in the 12th Five-Year Plan Period," April 20, 2011.

http://www.gapp.gov.cn/news/794/76650.shtml.

{51} People's Daily, "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Major Issues Pertaining to Deepening Reform of the Cultural System and Promoting the Great Development and

Flourishing of Socialist Culture," October 18, 2011.

http://cpc.people.com.cn/GB/64093/64094/16018068.html.

{52} The China Government website, "The 2011-2012 Index of Key Companies and Key Projects for Culture Export," September 21, 2012.

http://www.gov.cn/banshi/2012-09/21/content 2230304.htm.

- {53} The China Government website, "Several Opinions of the State Council Pertaining to Advancing Cultural Creative Idea and Design Services Relevant Industry," March 14, 2014. http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2014-03/14/content 8713.htm.
- {54} The China Government website, "Opinion of the State Council Pertaining to Accelerating the Development of Cultural Trade Overseas," March 17, 2014.

http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2014-03/17/content_8717.htm.

{55} The Ministry of Finance website, "The Opinion Pertaining to Deepening Culture and Finance Cooperation," March 17, 2014.

http://ha.mof.gov.cn/lanmudaohang/zhengcefagui/201501/t20150129 1186240.html.

{56} The China Government website, "Implementation Opinions Pertaining to Supporting the Development of Small and Micro-Cultural Enterprises," July 11, 2014.

http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/2014-07/11/content 5023765.htm.

{57} The Ministry of Finance website, "Guiding Opinions Pertaining to Promoting the Development the Cultural Industry with Unique Cultural Product," August 8, 2014. http://whs.mof.gov.cn/pdlb/zcfb/201408/t20140829 1133031.html.

{58} The Ministry of Commerce website, "Vision and Actions to Promote the Development of the Silk Road Economic Belt and the 21st Century Maritime Silk Road," January 26, 2016. http://www.mofcom.gov.cn/article/i/dxfw/jlyd/201601/20160101243342.shtml.

{59} The National Development and Reform Commission website, "Belt and Road' Cultural Development Action Plan (2016-2020)."

http://www.ndrc.gov.cn/fzgggz/fzgh/ghwb/gjjgh/201707/t20170720 855005.html.

{60} The Ministry of Culture and Tourism website, "Cultural Industry Development Plan During the 13th Five-Year Plan Period," April 20, 2017.

https://www.mct.gov.cn/whzx/ggtz/201704/t20170420 695671.htm.

{61} *Xinhua*, "Outline of the National Cultural Development and Reform Plan during the 13th Five-Year Plan Period," May 7, 2017.

http://www.xinhuanet.com//politics/2017-05/07/c 1120931794 5.htm.

{62} Foreign Affairs, "China's Soft-Power Push," July/August 2015 Edition.

https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/china/2015-06-16/china-s-soft-power-push.

{63} AEI, "China Global Investment Tracker."

http://www.aei.org/china-global-investment-tracker/.

{64} *Morning Post*, "2017 China Performance Market Annual Report," September 11, 2018. http://bjcb.morningpost.com.cn/html/2018-09/11/content 501330.htm.

{65} The Number One Economics Daily, "Wiener Musikverein Became Money Hall; Who Is Paying?" July 11, 2014.

https://www.yicai.com/news/3991623.html.

{66} The China Cultural Center website, "The China Cultural Center Introduction," February 10, 2015.

 $\underline{\text{http://cn.cccweb.org/portal/pubinfo/001002011/20150210/0c793f933c364d4c90f8fffb54771d00.}}\\ \underline{\text{html.}}$

{67} CNTV, "The Overseas China Cultural Center," August 4, 2014.

http://arts.cntv.cn/2014/08/04/ARTI1407146297943547.shtml.

{68} The Hanban website, "About Confucius Institute/Classrooms."

http://www.hanban.org/confuciousinstitutes/node 10961.htm.

{69} The Diplomat, "China's Confucius Institutes and the Soft War," July 8, 2015.

https://thediplomat.com/2015/07/chinas-confucius-institutes-and-the-soft-war/.

{70} The Beijing Front website, "Make China Image Shinier," April 4, 2018.

http://www.bjqx.org.cn/qxweb/n354881c756.aspx.

{71} The Qianzhan website, "Analysis of China Current Movie Theater and Market," November 6, 2018.

https://www.qianzhan.com/analyst/detail/220/181105-4f00d876.html.

{72} The National Association of Theatre Owners website, "Number of U.S. Movie Screens." http://www.natoonline.org/data/us-movie-screens/.

{73} The Heritage Foundation, "How China Is Taking Control of Hollywood."

https://www.heritage.org/asia/heritage-explains/how-china-taking-control-hollywood.

{74} *Xinhua*, "Secure a Decisive Victory in Building a Moderately Prosperous Society in All Respects and Strive for the Great Success of Socialism with Chinese Characteristics for a New Era," October 18, 2017.

http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/download/Xi_Jinping's_report_at_19th_CPC_National_Cong ress.pdf.

{75} BBC, "U.S. DMG Bought Eighty Percent of Eastern Television's Share," December 11, 2015.

https://www.bbc.com/zhongwen/trad/china/2015/12/151211 taiwan ebc us dmg.

{76} *Qiushi*, "Create Academic Language with China's Characteristics, China's Flavor, and China's Style," June 11, 2012.

http://www.gstheory.cn/wz/cmyl/201206/t20120611 163264.htm.

{77} The Beiao website, "The Beiao Group: 'Bringing In' Is for Better 'Going Global," March 20, 2015.

http://www.beiao.com/a/xinwendongtai/meitiguanzhu/2015/0715/162.html.

{78} The China Government website, "The GAPP and the China Export-Import Bank Signed Strategic Cooperation Agreement," August 26, 2010.

http://www.gov.cn/jrzg/2010-08/26/content 1688978.htm.

{79} The cg2577 website, "2016 China Performing Arts Annual Report: Total Market Reached 46.9 billion Yuan," June 13, 2017.

http://www.cg2577.com/news-303.html.

{80} People's Daily, "Cultures of China, Festivals of Spring Started," February 7, 2018.

http://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2018-02/07/nw.D110000renmrb 20180207 7-04.htm.

{81} People's Daily, "Major Embrace China Themed Events."

http://politics.people.com.cn/n/2015/0204/c242004-26505879.html.

{82} Xinhua, "Sino-Europe Civilization Exchange," March 21, 2019.

http://www.xinhuanet.com/world/2019-03/21/c 1124262426.htm.

{83} People's Daily, "Silk Road International Alliance of Satellite TV Was Founded," June 5, 2017.

http://media.people.com.cn/n1/2017/0605/c40606-29317906.html.

{84} The chapec.com website, "Community Member Institutes."

http://brmc.chnpec.com/en/member.shtml.

{85} The China News website, "Silk Road International Library Alliance Was Founded in Sichuan," May 28, 2018.

http://www.chinanews.com/cul/2018/05-28/8524629.shtml.

{86} The International Alliance of Museums of The Silk Road website, "(The International Alliance of Museums of The Silk Road) Alliance Overview."

http://www.musesilkroad.org/en/.

{87} *Xinhua*, "The Silk Road International Alliance of Art Museums and Galleries Was Founded in Beijing," June 19, 2018.

http://www.xinhuanet.com/world/2018-06/19/c 129897045.htm.

{88} *Xinhua*, "The Network of Silk Road Art Festivals Was Founded," October 23, 2017. http://silkroad.news.cn/2017/1023/65807.shtml.

{89} The Xi'an Jiao Tong University website, "The University Alliance of the Silk Road." http://uasr.xjtu.edu.cn/sy1/lmgk/jbgk.htm.

{90} The Ministry of Finance website, "Guiding Opinions on Promoting the Development the Cultural Industry with Unique Cultural Product," August 8, 2014.

http://whs.mof.gov.cn/pdlb/zcfb/201408/t20140829 1133031.html.

{91} *Chinascope*, "Chinese Ambassador Admitted Personal Involvement in Cancelling Shen Yun Performance," January 30, 2019.

http://chinascope.org/archives/17504.

{92} Chinascope, "Communism's Cultural Expansion: Communist Control Goes Abroad," May 8, 2012.

http://chinascope.org/archives/6747.

{93} CGTN, "ABOUT US - China Global Television Network."

https://www.cgtn.com/about-us.

{94} CGTN, "China to Merge State Media Broadcasting Giants," March 21, 2018.

https://news.cgtn.com/news/794d444f7a6b7a6333566d54/share p.html.

{95} The CAEG website, "(The CAEG) Profile," March 17, 2019.

http://en.caeg.cn/caeg/jtjj/201802/d8066827394c42caa914edb56441fbdd.shtml.

{96} AEI, "China Global Investment Tracker."

http://www.aei.org/china-global-investment-tracker/.

{97} The Epoch Times, China's Growing Influence on Hollywood, October 15,2018.

https://www.theepochtimes.com/chinas-growing-influence-on-hollywood 2690693.html.

{98} VOA, "He Qinglian: Why Wang Jianlin's Protection Shield Stops Working?" July 24, 2017.

https://www.voachinese.com/a/heqinglian-wangjianlin-20170723/3956295.html.